

**Commissioners**

*Sepi Wood, Chair*

*Robert Stine, Vice-Chair*

*Donald Eaton*

*Paul Ram*

**County Counsel to the  
Commission**

*Kristina Paszek,*

*Deputy County Counsel*

**Human Resources Department**

*Rocio Kiryczun,*

*Director of Human Resources*

455 County Center  
Redwood City, CA 94063  
650-363-4333  
[www.smcgov.org](http://www.smcgov.org)



**Civil Service Commission  
2018 Annual Report**

*This page intentionally left blank*

## I. Introduction

The Civil Service Commission (“Commission”), mandated by the County Charter, oversees the County’s Merit System to ensure the selection and retention of employees in the classified service based on merit and fitness. The Commission provides for:

- Standardization and classification of all positions
- Examination of candidates
- Establishment of eligible lists
- Certification of eligible candidates
- Length of probationary periods
- Temporary appointments in the absence of an eligible list
- Criteria and procedures for demotion, reduction in force, and reemployment
- Criteria and procedures for suspension, dismissal and other disciplinary action
- The hiring of unemployed persons under programs designed to relieve unemployment and their suspension, disciplining or removal
- The manner in which employees of an agency absorbed by the County may become County employees and the rights, if any, which shall accrue to them for their service with the agency
- Hearing appeals. Employees in the classified service may appeal any action pursuant to Commission Rule XIV *et seq.*

The Commission hears matters pertaining to dismissals, demotions, suspensions, below standard performance evaluations, applicant recruitment process, and examination process; reviews requests for extension of eligible lists; and allocates new or revised job classifications to an appropriate bargaining unit for employee/employer relation purposes.

The Commission is comprised of five Commissioners, appointed by the Board of Supervisors, to serve four-year terms. The Commission is supported by the County’s Human Resources Department. The Director of Human Resources serves as the executive officer for the Commission.

The purpose of the Civil Service Commission Annual Report is to provide an overview of the San Mateo County Civil Service Commission’s activities throughout the calendar year, and to comply with San Mateo County Board of Supervisors Resolution No. 069276, section 20. The report contains a summary of the Civil Service Commission appeals process, statistics on Commission hearings and outcomes, and observations and recommendations of the Commission.

The County currently has 5,691 positions for the 2018-19 fiscal year. Below is a chart of the total number of positions over the last five fiscal years.

FY 2014-15	FY 2015-16	FY 2016-17	FY 2017-18	FY 2018-19
5,438	5,574	5,644	5,684	5,691

Source: Budget System FY 2014-15 to FY 2017-18 Actuals and FY 2018-19 Adopted Budget

## II. Appeal Process

The appeal process commences with the filing of a petition for hearing. When a matter is granted a hearing, the Commission determines whether the matter will be heard by the Commission, by a board composed of one or more members of the Commission, or by a hearing officer appointed by the Commission for that purpose.

Parties to the hearing are entitled to be represented by counsel or a representative of his/her choice, subpoena and cross-examine witnesses, and present other evidence to the Commission, hearing board, or hearing officer as deemed pertinent to the matter at hand.

In any hearing on an appeal from a dismissal, demotion, or suspension, the burden of proof is on the appointing authority (usually the Department), and in all other types of hearings, the burden of proof is on the petitioner. In a hearing before the Commission, the Commission will make written findings of fact and render its final decision.

**Summary of 2018 Appeals:** In 2018, the Civil Service Commission received seven petitions for hearings (two dismissals, one demotion, one suspension, two non-punitive suspensions, and one below standard performance evaluation). The Commission granted hearings for six of the seven matters.

For the six matters, the Commission upheld the appointing authority's discipline imposed in one case, in one case the discipline was modified, one case is still pending review, and three cases were withdrawn prior to the hearing.

**Five Year Glance (2014-2018):** During the last five calendar years, there were 24 petitions for appeals. Of these, 21 (88% of all petitions filed) were granted a hearing.

The average number of appeal hearings conducted per year during the last five years has been four. Of the 21 appeals that were granted hearings, in nine cases (42.8%) the discipline imposed by the appointing authority was upheld by the Commission, in one case (4.8%) the discipline imposed was modified by the Commission, and in one case (4.8%) the appointing authority's discipline was not sustained. In addition, nine appeals (42.8%) were withdrawn prior to hearing, and one is pending hearing (4.8%).

**Recent Revisions and Additions to the Appeals Process:** In 2013 the Commission adopted a guideline on a trial basis of establishing time limits on presentation of hearing evidence and arguments. The purpose of this pilot project guideline was to determine whether it might reduce the length, and evidentiary and argument redundancy, of appeal hearings. Commissioners had raised concerns that they are provided materials in advance for some hearings, but not by all parties, and that often the parties then spend a great deal of time at the hearing presenting the same materials as had been provided in advance. Another concern raised was that of multiple witnesses being called to make the same point repeatedly, causing redundancy in the evidence presented.

It was decided that, on a trial basis, time limits (to be managed by the Chair) would be discussed and proposed for each side when the hearing is set. In addition, all parties are strongly encouraged to provide materials, including proposed findings of fact and decision in

advance of the hearing to best utilize the hearing for the opportunity for the Commission/Hearing Officer(s) to ask questions that will enable them to make informed decisions.

The Chair will continue to have the responsibility to ensure that hearing time is used efficiently and effectively. Production of each party’s materials prior to the hearings, and focused testimony at the hearings, are anticipated to allow the Commission to more readily reach fair, informed, and consistent decisions on matters brought before them.

<b>2018 Petitions for Hearing*</b>			
<b>Department</b>	<b>Disciplinary</b>	<b>Other</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>Health</b>	1	0	1
<b>Human Services</b>	0	1	1
<b>Probation</b>	1	0	1
<b>Public Works</b>	2	0	2
<b>Sheriff’s Office</b>	2	0	2
<b>Total</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>7</b>

\*Only departments that had appeals during 2018 are listed above.

**POST-HEARING DECISIONS BY DEPARTMENTS WITH APPEALS, 2014-2018\***

Department	Department Upheld					Department Modified					Department Not Sustained					Withdrawn					Pending	5 YEAR TOTAL	
	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2018		
Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder			1																				1
Health	1	1	1										1								1		5
Human Services																	2	1					3
Probation	1			1												1						1	4
Public Works										1													1
Sheriff's Office	1	1			1											1			1	2			7
<b>Total</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>		<b>21</b>

\*Only departments that had appeals during the last five years are listed above.

Total Decisions by Year				
2014	2015	2016	2017	2018**
5	4	4	2	6

\*\*one case pending

### III. Other Commission Activity

During 2018, the Commission held 10 meetings.

**New Classifications:** The Commission approved nine new classifications in 2018:

New Classifications	Bargaining Unit	Probation Period
<b>911 Communications Calltaker</b>	AFSCME – Communications Dispatch	2080 hours
<b>Assistant Director of Project Development Unit</b>	Management	2080 hours
<b>Clinical Documentation Specialist</b>	AFSCME: Health Services	1040 hours
<b>Natural Resource Specialist I</b>	AFSCME – Inspection and Regulation	1560 hours
<b>Natural Resource Specialist II</b>	AFSCME – Inspection and Regulation	1040 hours
<b>Residential Counselor III</b>	AFSCME: Human Services	1040 hours
<b>Senior Housing and Community Development Policy Analyst</b>	AFSCME – Planning	2080 hours
<b>Senior Sustainability Coordinator</b>	AFSCME – Inspection and Regulation	1040 hours
<b>Supervising Victim Advocate</b>	AFSCME: Human Services	1040 hours

The Commission reviews and approves all new classification descriptions, their bargaining unit assignments and probationary hour requirements to ensure the selection and retention of employees in the classified service on the basis of merit and fitness. As defined in the County Charter, the Commission shall prescribe rules that provide for the standardization and classification of all positions in the classified service. It is uncommon for Human Resources to submit new classifications that have not been vetted through the process and through the labor organizations (if represented) and therefore it is rarely that the Commission disapprove a new classification; however, it is possible for the Commission to instruct the Human Resources Department to conduct more research or provide more information.

**Extension of Eligible Lists:** In 2018, the Commission approved the extension of 29 eligibility lists as follows:

- 911 Communications Dispatcher I (V050AC) – 6 months
- Appraiser I/II (U074L) – 4 months
- Benefits Analyst – Spanish Speaking Preferred (G070U) – 1 month
- Benefits Analyst (G070) – 3 months
- Billing Specialist - Behavioral Health & Recovery Services (E414AK) – 5 months
- Carpenter/Mill Cabinet Worker (T030D) – 3 months
- Community Services Officer (T074) – 3 months
- Community Services Officer (T074K) – 3 months
- Deputy Public Guardian Conservator II/III/Exam Plan (G217 & G225) – 5 months
- District Attorney’s Inspector-Criminal Division (HO35H) – 6 months
- Elections Specialist Supervisor (E169B) – 3 months
- Elections Specialist Supervisor (E169B) – 3 months
- Fiscal Office Assistant I/II (E347G) – 2 months
- Intelligence Analyst (G050L) – 5 months
- Intelligence Analyst (G050L) – 6 months
- Legal Office Assistant (E373V) – 3 months
- Legal Office Services Manager (D135A)– 3 months
- Management Analyst-Probation Department (181DK) – 6 months
- Mental Health Counselor – 5 months
- Painter (T026E) – 1 month
- Paralegal – Part-time (E008I) – 6 months
- Probation Department Administrative Secretary III (E006A) – 5 months
- Public Works Technician I/II (N011P) – 2 months
- Resource Conservation Climate Specialist II-Limited Term (J083P) – 2 months
- Respiratory Therapist III (F134C) – 5 months
- Sheriff’s Criminal Records Technician – 6 months
- Sheriff’s Sergeant (H044O) – 6 months
- Stationary Engineer I – 5 months
- Utility Worker (T063BA) – 6 months

Extension of eligible lists is crucial in expediting hiring and selection process. By extending the list, a need for new recruitment when a viable list of candidates is available is eliminated thereby saving both time and resources. It also ensures that qualified candidates who have successfully participated in the examination process are provided an extended opportunity to be considered for County employment.

#### **IV. 2019 Workplan/Priorities**

- A. Schedule and hold appeal hearings as soon as practicable.
- B. Remain alert to opportunities to improve the Commission's procedures and Rules.